

1 ALPHA INVESTMENT, LLC,

2 Plaintiff,

3 No. C 11-03500 JSW

4 v.

5 ZYNGA, INC. and ANDREW TRADER,

6 Defendants.

7 **ORDER GRANTING MOTIONS**
TO DISMISS

8 Now before the Court are the motions to dismiss filed by defendant Zynga, Inc.
9 (“Zynga”) and Andrew Trader (“Trader”), as well as Trader’s motion to intervene on the
10 mandatory injunction claim. The Court has considered the parties’ papers, relevant legal
11 authority, and it finds the matter suitable for disposition without oral argument. *See* N.D. Civ.
12 L.R. 7-1(b). Accordingly, the hearing set for March 16, 2012 is VACATED, and the Court
13 GRANTS Zynga’s and Trader’s motions to dismiss. The Court denies Trader’s motion to
14 intervene as moot.¹

15 **BACKGROUND**

16 This action by plaintiff Alpha Investment, LLC (“Alpha”) arises out of an agreement
17 Alpha made with Trader to purchase one million shares of Zynga stock. Because Zynga’s stock

18 _____
19 ¹ The Court GRANTS Zynga’s and Trader’s Requests for Judicial Notice (“RJN”).
20 *See* Fed. R. Evid. 201.

21 The Court notes that Alpha seeks to incorporate six pages of its statement of facts
22 into its brief in opposition to Zynga’s motion to dismiss. Alpha then also seeks to
23 incorporate pages from its brief in opposition to Zynga’s motion into its opposition to
24 Trader’s motion. Alpha’s incorporation of pages from other briefs is an attempt to avoid this
25 Court’s page limits. Although the Court will not strike Alpha’s excess pages at this time,
26 Alpha is on notice that any further attempts to avoid this Court’s Standing Orders, without
27 receiving leave of Court in advance, will be sanctioned.

1 was not yet registered, Alpha was required to comply with certain conditions precedent in order
2 to acquire the stock.²

3 Alpha and Trader were connected through SecondMarket. (Compl., ¶ 27.) On August
4 26, 2010, Alpha and Trader entered into a Stock Purchase Agreement (“August SPA”), pursuant
5 to which Alpha agreed to purchase one million shares of Zynga Class A Common Stock from
6 Trader. (Id., ¶ 28.) Alpha placed the agreed upon purchase amount, \$12,870,000 into an
7 escrow account. The August SPA provided that Alpha agreed to be bound by and comply with
8 the limitations on transfer of the shares as set forth in the Stock Option Exercise Agreement,
9 dated January 3, 2008, (“Exercise Agreement”) between Zynga and Trader. (Id., ¶ 30.)

10 The Exercise Agreement required, *inter alia*,

11 **5. Restricted Securities.**

12 5.1 No Transfer Unless Registered or Exempt. [Trader]
13 understands that [Trader] may not transfer any Shares unless such Shares are
14 registered under the Securities Act or qualified under applicable state securities
15 laws or unless, in the opinion of counsel to [Zynga], exemptions from such
registration and qualification requirements are available. . . . [Trader] has also
....been advised that exemptions from registration and qualification may not be
available or may not permit [Trader] to transfer all or any of the Shares in the
amounts or at the times proposed by [Trader].

16 ...

17 **6. Restrictions on Transfers.**

18 6.1 Disposition of Shares. [Trader] hereby agrees that [Trader]
19 shall make no disposition of the Shares (other than as permitted by this
Exercise Agreement) unless and until: ...

20 (b) [Trader] shall have complied with all requirements of
this Exercise Agreement applicable to the disposition of the Shares;

21 (c) [Trader] shall have provided [Zynga] with written
assurances, in form and substance satisfactory to counsel for [Zynga], that (i)
the proposed disposition does not require registration of the Shares under the
Securities Act or (ii) all appropriate actions necessary for ... any exemption
from registration . . . have been taken; and

22 (d) [Trader] shall have provided [Zynga] with written
assurances, in form and substance satisfactory to [Zynga], that the proposed
disposition will not result in the contravention of any transfer restrictions
applicable to the Shares pursuant to the [California Corporations Code and any
rules or regulations promulgated thereunder].

25 (Declaration of Jeffrey M. Kaban (“Kaban Decl.”), Ex. A.)

26

27

28 ² Subsequent to Alpha filing this action, Zynga registered its stock on December 15, 2011. (Trader’s RJD, Ex. A.)

1 The Exercise Agreement further provides that Zynga has a right of first refusal to
2 purchase the shares before the shares can be sold or transferred to a third-party. (*Id.*, Ex. A. at ¶
3 9.) Pursuant to paragraph 9.1, Trader must deliver to Zynga notice of any proposed transfer of
4 shares. (*Id.*, Ex. A. at ¶ 9.1.) Paragraph 9.5 then provides that if Zynga does not exercise its
5 right of first refusal, Trader may proceed with the proposed transaction, but only if: “(i) such
6 sale or other transfer is consummated within 120 days after the date of the Notice, [and] (ii) any
7 such sale or other transfer is effected in compliance with all applicable securities laws ...” (*Id.*,
8 Ex. A. at ¶ 9.5.) Paragraph 9.5 also provides that if the shares are not transferred within 120
9 days of the notice, a new notice must be given to Zynga and Zynga must be offered the right of
10 first refusal again. (*Id.*)

11 The Exercise Agreement provides that Zynga:

12 will not be required (i) to transfer on its books any Shares that have been sold or
13 otherwise transferred in violation of any of the provisions of this Exercise
14 Agreement or (ii) to treat as owner of such Shares, or to accord the right to vote
or pay dividends to any purchaser or other transferee to whom such Shares have
been so transferred.

15 (*Id.*, Ex. A. at ¶ 12.3.)

16 On August 26, 2010, Trader provided Zynga and counsel for Zynga with a notice of the
17 proposed transfer. (Compl., ¶ 32.) On November 23, 2010, Alpha signed an amended Stock
18 Purchase Agreement (“November SPA”) and a related representation letter (the “November
19 Representation Letter”). (*Id.*, ¶ 50.) The November SPA states that, prior to the closing date,
20 Trader will provide Zynga, *inter alia*:

21 an opinion, in form and substance satisfactory to [Zynga], from counsel to
22 [Trader] satisfactory to [Zynga] that states that the offer and sale of the Shares is
23 being made pursuant to Rule 144 of the Securities Act of 1933, as amended . . .
24 and will be in compliance with all applicable federal and state securities laws ...
any other agreement or document reasonably required by [Zynga] in connection
with the transfer of the Shares.

25 (Kaban Decl., Ex. C at ¶ 2.2.) The November SPA further provides that Alpha is bound by, and
26 the Shares will be subject to, the Exercise Agreement between Zynga and Trader and the
27 Representation letter. (*Id.*, Ex. C at ¶¶ 5.1, 5.2.)

28 The Representation Letter provides that both Alpha and Trader agree, *inter alia*:

1 [Zynga] shall have no liability to [Alpha] for the failure of the transactions
2 contemplated by the Agreement to be consummated for any reason, including, the
3 failure of [Alpha] or [Trader] to deliver requested opinions or additional
4 documents to the Company as contemplated by Sections 2.2 and 2.3 of the
5 Agreement

6 (Kaban Decl., Ex. D.)

7 Alpha alleges that on September 29, 2010, Zynga emailed some proposed transfer
8 instructions and recite the following excerpt:

9 Pursuant to Section 2.2.of the Stock Purchase Agreement, you must obtain a
10 legal opinion that states that the offer and sale of your shares is being made
11 pursuant to Rule 144 of the Securities Act of 1933, as amended, and will be in
12 compliance with all applicable federal and state securities laws. A draft of such
13 opinion should be forwarded to our outside legal counsel.... .

14 (Compl., ¶ 57.) Alphas submitted a copy of the proposed transfer instructions. (Declaration of
15 Andrew H. Reynard (“Reynard Decl.”), Ex. A.) The document further provides an address for
16 delivery of the “draft opinion” and separate addresses for delivery of the “executed opinion.”
17 (*Id.*, Ex. A at p. 2.)³

18 Alpha further alleges, on information and belief, that Trader satisfied the requirements
19 of Paragraph 2.2. of the November SPA, including that Trader delivered to Zynga “a legal
20 opinion from TroyGould PC stating that the offer and sale of the Shares is being made pursuant
21 to Rule 144 of the Securities Act of 1933, as amended, and will be in compliance with all
22 applicable federal and state securities laws.” (Compl., ¶ 58.) The opinion letter from
23 TroyGould PC was not dated or signed. (Kaban Decl., Ex. E.)

24 The Court shall address specific additional facts in the remainder of this Order.

25 ANALYSIS

26 A. Applicable Legal Standards for Motion to Dismiss.

27 A motion to dismiss is proper under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6) where the
28 pleadings fail to state a claim upon which relief can be granted. The complaint is construed in
the light most favorable to the non-moving party and all material allegations in the complaint

29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
5510
5511
5512
5513
5514
5515
5516
5517
5518
5519
5520
5521
5522
5523
5524
5525
5526
5527
5528
5529
5530
5531
5532
5533
5534
5535
5536
5537
5538
5539
5540
5541
5542
5543
5544
5545
5546
5547
5548
5549
5550
5551
5552
5553
5554
5555
5556
5557
5558
5559
55510
55511
55512
55513
55514
55515
55516
55517
55518
55519
55520
55521
55522
55523
55524
55525
55526
55527
55528
55529
55530
55531
55532
55533
55534
55535
55536
55537
55538
55539
55540
55541
55542
55543
55544
55545
55546
55547
55548
55549
55550
55551
55552
55553
55554
55555
55556
55557
55558
55559
555510
555511
555512
555513
555514
555515
555516
555517
555518
555519
555520
555521
555522
555523
555524
555525
555526
555527
555528
555529
555530
555531
555532
555533
555534
555535
555536
555537
555538
555539
555540
555541
555542
555543
555544
555545
555546
555547
555548
555549
555550
555551
555552
555553
555554
555555
555556
555557
555558
555559
5555510
5555511
5555512
5555513
5555514
5555515
5555516
5555517
5555518
5555519
5555520
5555521
5555522
5555523
5555524
5555525
5555526
5555527
5555528
5555529
5555530
5555531
5555532
5555533
5555534
5555535
5555536
5555537
5555538
5555539
5555540
5555541
5555542
5555543
5555544
5555545
5555546
5555547
5555548
5555549
5555550
5555551
5555552
5555553
5555554
5555555
5555556
5555557
5555558
5555559
55555510
55555511
55555512
55555513
55555514
55555515
55555516
55555517
55555518
55555519
55555520
55555521
55555522
55555523
55555524
55555525
55555526
55555527
55555528
55555529
55555530
55555531
55555532
55555533
55555534
55555535
55555536
55555537
55555538
55555539
55555540
55555541
55555542
55555543
55555544
55555545
55555546
55555547
55555548
55555549
55555550
55555551
55555552
55555553
55555554
55555555
55555556
55555557
55555558
55555559
555555510
555555511
555555512
555555513
555555514
555555515
555555516
555555517
555555518
555555519
555555520
555555521
555555522
555555523
555555524
555555525
555555526
555555527
555555528
555555529
555555530
555555531
555555532
555555533
555555534
555555535
555555536
555555537
555555538
555555539
555555540
555555541
555555542
555555543
555555544
555555545
555555546
555555547
555555548
555555549
555555550
555555551
555555552
555555553
555555554
555555555
555555556
555555557
555555558
555555559
5555555510
5555555511
5555555512
5555555513
5555555514
5555555515
5555555516
5555555517
5555555518
5555555519
5555555520
5555555521
5555555522
5555555523
5555555524
5555555525
5555555526
5555555527
5555555528
5555555529
5555555530
5555555531
5555555532
5555555533
5555555534
5555555535
5555555536
5555555537
5555555538
5555555539
5555555540
5555555541
5555555542
5555555543
5555555544
5555555545
5555555546
5555555547
5555555548
5555555549
5555555550
5555555551
5555555552
5555555553
5555555554
5555555555
5555555556
5555555557
5555555558
5555555559
55555555510
55555555511
55555555512
55555555513
55555555514
55555555515
55555555516
55555555517
55555555518
55555555519
55555555520
55555555521
55555555522
55555555523
55555555524
55555555525
55555555526
55555555527
55555555528
55555555529
55555555530
55555555531
55555555532
55555555533
55555555534
55555555535
55555555536
55555555537
55555555538
55555555539
55555555540
55555555541
55555555542
55555555543
55555555544
55555555545
55555555546
55555555547
55555555548
55555555549
55555555550
55555555551
55555555552
55555555553
55555555554
55555555555
55555555556
55555555557
55555555558
55555555559
555555555510
555555555511
555555555512
555555555513
555555555514
555555555515
555555555516
555555555517
555555555518
555555555519
555555555520
555555555521
555555555522
555555555523
555555555524
555555555525
555555555526
555555555527
555555555528
555555555529
555555555530
555555555531
555555555532
555555555533
555555555534
555555555535
555555555536
555555555537
555555555538
555555555539
555555555540
555555555541
555555555542
555555555543
555555555544
555555555545
555555555546
555555555547
555555555548
555555555549
555555555550
555555555551
555555555552
555555555553
555555555554
555555555555
555555555556
555555555557
555555555558
555555555559
5555555555510
5555555555511
5555555555512
5555555555513
5555555555514
5555555555515
5555555555516
5555555555517
5555555555518
5555555555519
5555555555520
5555555555521
5555555555522
5555555555523
5555555555524
5555555555525
5555555555526
5555555555527
5555555555528
5555555555529
5555555555530
5555555555531
5555555555532
5555555555533
5555555555534
5555555555535
5555555555536
5555555555537
5555555555538
5555555555539
5555555555540
5555555555541
5555555555542
5555555555543
5555555555544
5555555555545
5555555555546
5555555555547
5555555555548
5555555555549
5555555555550
5555555555551
5555555555552
5555555555553
5555555555554
5555555555555
5555555555556
5555555555557
5555555555558
5555555555559
55555555555510
55555555555511
55555555555512
55555555555513
55555555555514
55555555555515
55555555555516
55555555555517
55555555555518
55555555555519
55555555555520
55555555555521
55555555555522
55555555555523
55555555555524
55555555555525
55555555555526
55555555555527
55555555555528
55555555555529
55555555555530
55555555555531
55555555555532
55555555555533
55555555555534
55555555555535
55555555555536
55555555555537
55555555555538
55555555555539
55555555555540
55555555555541
55555555555542
55555555555543
55555555555544
55555555555545
55555555555546
55555555555547
55555555555548
55555555555549
55555555555550
55555555555551
55555555555552
55555555555553
55555555555554
55555555555555
55555555555556
55555555555557
55555555555558
55555555555559
555555555555510
555555555555511
555555555555512
555555555555513
555555555555514
555555555555515
555555555555516
555555555555517
555555555555518
555555555555519
555555555555520
555555555555521
555555555555522
555555555555523
555555555555524
555555555555525
555555555555526
555555555555527
555555555555528
555555555555529
555555555555530
555555555555531
555555555555532
555555555555533
555555555555534
555555555555535
555555555555536
555555555555537
555555555555538
555555555555539
555555555555540
555555555555541
555555555555542
555555555555543
555555555555544
555555555555545
555555555555546
555555555555547
555555555555548
555555555555549
555555555555550
555555555555551
555555555555552
555555555555553
555555555555554
555555555555555
555555555555556
555555555555557
555555555555558
555555555555559
5555555555555510
5555555555555511
5555555555555512
5555555555555513
5555555555555514
5555555555555515
5555555555555516
5555555555555517
5555555555555518
5555555555555519
5555555555555520
5555555555555521
5555555555555522
5555555555555523
5555555555555524
5555555555555525
5555555555555526
5555555555555527
5555555555555528
5555555555555529
5555555555555530
5555555555555531
5555555555555532
5555555555555533
5555555555555534
5555555555555535
5555555555555536
5555555555555537
5555555555555538
5555555555555539
5555555555555540
5555555555555541
5555555555555542
5555555555555543
5555555555555544
5555555555555545
5555555555555546
5555555555555547
5555555555555548
5555555555555549
5555555555555550
5555555555555551
5555555555555552
5555555555555553
5555555555555554
5555555555555555
5555555555555556<br

1 are taken to be true. *Sanders v. Kennedy*, 794 F.2d 478, 481 (9th Cir. 1986). The Court may
2 consider the facts alleged in the complaint, documents attached to the complaint, documents
3 relied upon but not attached to the complaint, when the authenticity of those documents is not
4 questioned, and other matters of which the Court can take judicial notice. *Zucco Partners LLC*
5 *v. Digimarc Corp.*, 552 F.3d 981, 990 (9th Cir. 2009).

6 Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 8(a) requires only “a short and plain statement of the
7 claim showing that the pleader is entitled to relief.” Even under Rule 8(a)’s liberal pleading
8 standard, “a plaintiff’s obligation to provide the ‘grounds’ of his ‘entitle[ment] to relief’
9 requires more than labels and conclusions, and a formulaic recitation of the elements of a cause
10 of action will not do.” *Bell Atlantic Corporation v. Twombly*, 550 U.S. 544, 555 (2007) (citing
11 *Papasan v. Allain*, 478 U.S. 265, 286 (1986)). Pursuant to *Twombly*, a plaintiff must not merely
12 allege conduct that is conceivable but must instead allege “enough facts to state a claim to relief
13 that is plausible on its face.” *Id.* at 570. “A claim has facial plausibility when the plaintiff
14 pleads factual content that allows the court to draw the reasonable inference that the defendant
15 is liable for the misconduct alleged.” *Ashcroft v. Iqbal*, 129 S. Ct. 1937, 1949 (2009) (citing
16 *Twombly*, 550 U.S. at 556). “The plausibility standard is not akin to a probability requirement,
17 but it asks for more than a sheer possibility that a defendant has acted unlawfully. ... When a
18 complaint pleads facts that are merely consistent with a defendant’s liability, it stops short of
19 the line between possibility and plausibility of entitlement to relief.” *Id.* (quoting *Twombly*, 550
20 U.S. at 556-57) (internal quotation marks omitted).

21 **B. Zynga’s Motion to Dismiss.**

22 Zynga argues that all of Alpha’s claims against it fail based on Alpha’s failure to plead
23 that it satisfied the conditions precedent for any stock transfer. The Court agrees. First, Alpha
24 fails to plead that its proposed purchase of Zynga’s shares would be “in compliance with all
25 applicable securities laws.” (Kaban Decl., Ex. A at ¶ 9.5.)

26 Second, taking into consideration the documents of which the Court may take judicial
27 notice, Trader did not provide a completed legal opinion letter as required. (*Id.*, Ex. C at ¶ 2.2.)
28 The opinion letter from TroyGould PC alleged in the complaint was only an unsigned, undated,

1 draft legal opinion. (Compl., ¶ 58; Kaban Decl., Ex. E.) Plaintiff argues, based on Zynga’s
2 proposed transfer instructions, that only a draft letter was required. However, Plaintiff does not
3 allege, or submit and documents showing, that the alleged *proposed* transfer instructions altered
4 the written agreements requiring “an opinion, in form and substance satisfactory to [Zynga],
5 from counsel to [Trader] satisfactory to [Zynga] that states that the offer and sale of the Shares
6 is being made pursuant to Rule 144 of the Securities Act of 1933, as amended . . . and will be in
7 compliance with all applicable federal and state securities laws... .” (Kaban Decl., Ex. C. at ¶
8 2.2.) Moreover, upon review of the proposed transfer instructions submitted by Alpha, Zynga
9 was merely asking to review a draft of the legal opinion letter at least ten days prior to the date
10 of the intended transfer. By providing separate instructions for delivery of a “draft opinion” and
11 an “executed opinion,” the transfer instructions make clear that the request for a draft legal
12 opinion was an additional requirement that did not replace the requirement to provide an
13 executed legal opinion letter. (Reynard Decl., Ex. A.) The transfer instructions do not appear
14 to excuse the requirement to provide a formal, executed legal opinion letter. Therefore, the
15 Court finds that Alpha fails to allege this condition precedent was satisfied.

16 To the extent Alpha contends only a draft letter was required, Alpha may amend its
17 complaint if it can allege facts in good faith, or attach documents sufficient to show, that the
18 requirement to provide a legal opinion letter had been changed. Alternatively, Alpha may
19 amend its complaint if it can allege facts in good faith that Trader provided a non-draft legal
20 opinion letter to Zynga.

21 Third, the transaction was required to be completed within 120 days after the Notice was
22 sent to Zynga. Alpha does not allege that the transaction was completed within 120 days.
23 Instead, Alpha argues that it completed all the required conditions precedent and that Zynga
24 unreasonably delayed consummation of the transaction. (Opp. to Zynga’s Mot. at 9.) However,
25 as discussed above, Alpha has not yet alleged that it did complete all of the conditions
26 precedent. Accordingly, the Court finds that Alpha fails to allege that the transaction was
27 completed within 120 days or allege facts which, if true, show that the 120 day requirement was
28

1 or should be excused. Accordingly, the Court grants Zynga's motion to dismiss. However, the
2 Court will provide Alpha with leave to amend to cure the above described defects.

3 Nevertheless, with respect to Alpha's claim for a mandatory injunction, injunctive relief
4 is merely a remedy, not an independent cause of action. *See Hafiz v. Greenpoint Mortgage,*
5 *Inc.*, 652 F. Supp. 2d 1039, 1043 (N.D. Cal. 2009) (citing *Boeing Co. v. Cascade Corp.*, 207
6 F.3d 1177, 1192 (9th Cir. 2000)); *see also Cox Communication PCS, LP v. City of San Marco*,
7 204 F. Supp. 2d 1272, 1283 (S.D. Cal. 2002) ("Injunctive relief, like damages, is a *remedy*
8 *requested by the parties, not a separate cause of action.*") (emphasis in original); *City of South*
9 *Pasadena v. Dept. of Transp.*, 29 Cal. App. 4th 1280, 1293 (1994) ("Injunctive relief is a
10 remedy, not a cause of action."). Therefore, Alpha's leave to amend does not include leave to
11 plead a separate claim for an injunction. Because Alpha may not plead an independent claim
12 for an injunction, Trader's motion to intervene as a defendant on that claim is denied as moot.

13 **C. Trader's Motion.**

14 Trader moves to dismiss Alpha's fourth claim, a breach of contract claim pled in the
15 alternative against Trader. Earlier in the complaint, Alpha pleads that Trader complied with all
16 of the conditions precedent to the transaction, including the requirement to provide a
17 satisfactory legal opinion letter to Zynga. In the alternative, Alpha pleads that:

18 To the extent that Trader did not provide Zynga with a satisfactory legal opinion
19 in the TroyGould PC Legal Opinion, or failed to satisfy any other requirements
20 for delivery Zynga under Section 2.2 of the November SPA (or Section 2.3 of
the August SPA, as applicable), Trader failed to meet his obligations and
therefore breached the November SPA and/or August SPA.

21 (Compl., ¶ 97.) Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 8(d)(3), a party may "state as many
22 separate claims or defenses it has, regardless of consistency." Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(d)(3).
23 However, in light of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 11, courts have held that "a pleader may
24 assert contradictory statements of fact only when legitimately in doubt about the facts in
25 question." *American Int'l. Adjustment Co. v. Galvin*, 86 F.3d 1455, 1461 (7th Cir. 1996); *see*
26 *also 2004 Stuart Moldaw Trust v. XE L.I.F.E., LLC*, 642 F. Supp. 2d 226, 240 (S.D.N.Y 2009);
27 *Violet Blue v. Johnson*, 2008 WL 941959, *7 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 7, 2008). Here, because the
28

1 alleged facts concern actions by other parties, Alpha is legitimately in doubt as to whether
2 Trader did in fact provide a satisfactory legal opinion letter to Zynga.

3 However, Alpha further pleads that it has complied with all closing conditions and
4 requirements under the November and August SPAs. (Compl., ¶ 96.) As discussed above, a
5 requirement for the proposed transaction was that it be “in compliance with all applicable
6 securities laws.” (Kaban Decl., Ex. A at ¶ 9.5.) Alpha has not alleged that this requirement has
7 been satisfied. Accordingly, although Alpha may plead this claim in the alternative, it has not
8 yet pled sufficient facts. Therefore, the Court dismisses this claim, but will provide Alpha with
9 leave to amend.

CONCLUSION

11 For the foregoing reasons, the Court GRANTS Zynga's and Trader's motion to dismiss
12 and DENIES Trader's motion to intervene as moot. With the exception of Alpha's claim for a
13 mandatory injunction, the Court provides Alpha with leave to amend. Alpha shall file its
14 amended complaint, if any, within twenty days of the date of this Order. If Alpha files an
15 amended complaint in accordance with this Order, Zynga and Trader shall either file answers or
16 move to dismiss within twenty days of service of the amended complaint. If Alpha does not
17 amend its complaint, this action will be dismissed.

18 The Court FURTHER ORDERS that the case management conference is VACATED
19 and will be reset, if necessary, at a later date.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

22 || Dated: March 12, 2012

Jeffrey S. White
JEFFREY S. WHITE
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE